

## REMARKS

### Status of this application

Twenty claims were originally submitted and three new claims 21-23 have been added by this response. In the Office Action mailed November 18, 2004, claims 3, 10 and 17 were objected to as containing a typographical or spelling error, and claim 13 was objected to as being duplicative. Claims 15, 16 and 18 were rejected under 35 U.S.C §102(b) as being anticipated by Dragan Patent 3,561,683 (hereinafter "Dragan"), and claims 1-4, 8-11 and 17 were rejected under 35 U.S.C §103(a) as being obvious in view of Dragan. Claims 5, 6, 12-14, 19 and 20 were rejected under 35 U.S.C §103(a) as being obvious in view of Dragan in view of Rhoads patent 1,622,347 (hereinafter "Rhoads"), and claim 7 was rejected under 35 U.S.C §103(a) as being obvious in view of Dragan in view of Rodman patent 2,831,331 (hereinafter "Rodman").

Reconsideration is requested in view of the foregoing amendments and the following remarks.

### **The Objections based on Informalities**

This response corrects the error in claims 3, 10 and 17 by replacing "in" with -- is --. Claim 13 which duplicated claim 12 has been cancelled. These amendments are believed to correct the informalities noted by the Examiner.

### **The Rejections based on Dragon 3,561,683**

Dragan describes a convertible light fixture that can be readily converted between and electric fixture and a candle-holding fixture. The fixture includes a female electrical socket adapted to receive either a candle (as illustrated in Fig. 3) or an electric light as seen in Fig. 2 consisting of a candle-shaped column 19 provided with a threaded socket 23 at its top that receives a conventional electric light bulb 24. The fixture is converted by unplugging and removing the column 19 along with the attached light bulb 24 and replacing it with a candle holder adapter 26 and a candle 30.

While the Dragon convertible fixture does provide either electric lighting or candlelight, it requires a special electric fixture with removable electric lamps, and does not provide candle lighting with a conventional electric fixture (as opposed to a specialized convertible fixture).

Applicants provide the solution with a convention fixture by using a candle holder that forms a hollow passageway in the bottom of candle holder that fits over a conventional electric socket assembly.

While the Dragon candle holding adapter is secured by a female socket seen at 14 in Fig. 2, this socket receives and secures the electric lamp assembly, and does not include the threaded socket that receives the light bulb. Independent claims 1, 8 and 15 have been amended to clarify this distinction by more clearly pointing out and distinctly claiming this aspect of applicants' invention. It is believed that these amendments render claims 1, 8 and 15, and the newly added independent claim 21, as well as all of the remaining claims which are dependent thereon, clearly allowable over the cited references, and reconsideration of all claims as thus amended is requested.

The Examiner has correctly noted that Dragon discloses a "decorative drip plate or pan 18 that circumscribes the female socket 14." Dragon does not, however, suggest that the drip plate 18 is part of the candle holder adapter (claims 2, 9 and 16) and certainly does not disclose that it is an integral part of the candle holder adapter (claims 3, 10, 17 and 23) or is detachable from the remainder of the candle holder (claims 4, 11 and 18). There is nothing in the Dragan disclosure to suggest that the drip plate 18 is not permanently attached to the female socket 14 or that it is either an integral part of or a detachable part of the candle holder adapter as claimed.

Claims 5, 13 and 19 set forth a candle holder having outside walls which form an extension of the outer surface of a candle and visually appear to be part of the candle. The cited Fig. 3 of Rhoads shows a candle which is formed to have a shoulder as seen at 24 and at 28. These shoulders are part of the candle, not the outside walls of a candle holder. Similarly, Rhoads does not disclose a candle holder that is covered with a coating that simulates the outer surface of a candle as set forth in claim 6 or with a layer of candle wax as set forth in claims 14 and 20 Reconsideration of the rejection of claims 5-6, 13-14 and 19-20 is accordingly requested for this additional reason.

Newly added claims 21-23 have been added to complete the scope of applicants' protection and are believed to be allowable over the cited art for the reasons given above.

**Conclusion**

Allowance of claims 1-12 and 14-23 as now presented is requested.

Respectfully submitted,



Dated: February 13, 2005

Charles G. Call, Reg. 20,406

**Certificate of Transmission under 37 CFR 1.8**

I hereby certify that this *Amendment* is being transmitted by facsimile to the central facsimile number of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, (703) 872-9306, on February 13, 2005.



Dated: February 13, 2005

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Charles G. Call, Reg. No. 20,406  
USPTO Customer No. 021253  
68 Horse Pond Road  
West Yarmouth, MA 02673  
Ph. (508) 778-2630 Fax (508) 629-6540  
call@patentsoft.com